The Correlation Between Social Media Governance Indices and Online Audience in selected magazines of ABS-CBN Publishing Inc.

Sarah Giselle LOPEZ-POZAS
University of the Philippines Manila

Abstract

Three main outputs of the study describe social media governance within ABS-CBN Publishing, Inc. (API). First is that the company’s ten selected active magazines, as presented by a survey of 18 social media managers, collectively present a weak regulatory framework, a medium level of expertise, the occasional presence of a social media strategy, and a medium level of activity using the four indices of social media governance and other pertinent variables as adapted from the Social Media Governance DELPHI study of Fink, Linke, and Zerfass (2012). Significant correlations include Online Audience (tally of Facebook, Instagram, and Twitter followers) with Regulatory Framework; with Strategy; with Social Media Experience, and Regulatory Framework with Social Media Experience. Regression analysis (Online Audience or the tally of followers being the dependent variable) indicated Regulatory Framework as a significant predictor of the variance of Online Audience. Interviews with key personnel handling social media for the entire media company suggest that due to the nature of ABS-CBN as a media company with focus on cable channels, news, and film, the focus and investment for social media tends to stay with the accounts of these particular lines of businesses instead of Publishing. A content analysis of the top two API Facebook pages along with their theme counterparts from their main competitor aided the creation of dimension maps that revealed API’s content was focused on the promotion of partners (within ABS-CBN and externally) and content sharing which was personal in nature, respectively. Competitor accounts, on the other hand, were consistent in pulling in visitors from social media to their magazines’ websites through diverse and audience-centric content.

Keywords: digital, publishing, social media
It’s not that communication has changed. It’s that we have to realize it’s continually changing – faster and more diversely than ever before. The advent of the digital age has brought with it what is proving itself to be a powerful new medium for a few years now - social media. Never has a medium gotten as relevant across so many audience segments due to its capability of reach without requiring huge monetary and time investment. With the development of Web 2.0, brands and companies are capable of using social media in combination with traditional media (TV, print, radio) to gain better understanding of their advertising expenditure, brand image, and even their competitors.

With these in mind, companies are asking the question: How do they leverage this tool to the best of their ability to attain their goals? The most famous and the largest of our local companies are found to outsource the use of this tool to advertising or public relations agencies which they deem have better knowledge of the social media landscape and digital campaigning. However, this business-to-business relationship does not necessarily encourage the development of a formal social media structure that can be sustained by the company to attain long-term goals. The question of whether benefits are getting fully reaped when social media governance is or not intertwined with non-outsourced, long-standing, full-time work culture has yet to be answered and will be explored in this paper to an extent after establishing an answer to the question of whether or not social media affects brand awareness and how?

Kaplan and Haenlein (2010) define Social Media as internet-based applications built on the ideological and technological foundations of Web 2.0 (as cited by Fink, Zerfass and Linke, p.3). O’Reilly (2005) uses the term “Web 2.0” to describe the internet at present - characterized by the proliferation of platforms, crowd or user-generated information, ubiquity and dynamism, and customer-based content. It is differentiated from the internet as Web 1.0 which characterizes the virtual space of a few years ago as inviting passive consumption rather than Web 2.0’s support of active creation, exchanging, and sharing of information. Communication in this new digital market is a lot more complex.
Common social media activities done online with Web 2.0 applications are blogging and social networking with top brands including Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube (Baur, 2010).

Bannon (2012) in Nielsen’s Social Media Report of 2012 cites that social media and social networking, though no longer “new”, continue to grow rapidly now through two ways: mobile (mobile apps and mobile web accessed through smartphones, tablets, and other portable devices) and the proliferation of new social media sites (whether for networking or new sites with social media integration). Usage is expected to evolve even further through the rise of social activity being integrated with the television viewing experience and through the transformation of customer service online.

The traditional instruments of advertising that include television, print, radio, and out-of-home communication differ in many aspects from this new tool. Keller (2009) wrote that social media had far greater capacity than traditional media to reach the public due to its length of availability. Items and services can stay available online much longer than it can on traditional media. Baur (2010) also cites that social media has a greater capacity for richness of customer-producer relationship, has lower delivery and feedback cost, better measurability of effectiveness, wider reach, and the ability to be sought out rather than interrupt consumption of information.

In the Philippines, both internet and social media usage are on an incline. The Yahoo-Nielsen Net Index of 2011 shows that internet usage in the country had clear pockets of growth especially in Metro Manila (43% reach as of the first quarter of 2011 from 36% at the same period in 2009), Cebu (34% from 26%), and Davao(37% from 29%). The index shows that visiting social networking sites was the most common activity in 2011 as 82% of users cited it as a purpose for internet usage, with it exhibiting the highest growth as well from 51% in 2009. To compare, Search was the second most common online activity at 80%, being higher than social networking in 2009 with 58%. The index presents two other good points that make the case for more company spending on brand presence online. First is that internet usage is highest among market segment ABC1 with 66% reach of that segment in that
quarter. Second, private access (home use and personal devices) increased from 2009 to 2011 significantly, especially in the aforementioned segment. On the top social networks, usage in the Philippines also ranks high. In the 2012 Socialbakers report according to news site Rappler, the Philippines was 8th on Facebook with 27,720,300 accounts, which is about 27.75% of the population and 93.33% of the online population. For Twitter, the Inquirer reported that the Philippines ranked 10th with 9.5 million followers from the global 517 million in 2012.

Social Media Governance

Social Media Governance is a concept presented by Fink, Zerfass and Linke (2011) as “the formal or informal frameworks which regulate the actions of the members of an organization within the social web”. Four indices were posited to describe this concept, namely, Social Media Regulatory Framework, Social Media Skills, Social Media Strategy, and Social Media Activities. The first two indices or dimensions make up Social Media Structure while the last two are part of Social Media Action.

Studies about social media and its governance or management are of value to a lot of companies when proven to positively affect what is termed as Brand Knowledge. Keller and Davey (2001) describe building Brand Awareness, one of the main dimensions of Brand Knowledge, as the means of making sure that potential customers are aware of the categories in which a brand competes. Brand awareness was viewed as a crucial component of brand equity according to the two, since all other brand goals are built with it as a foundation. Brand Awareness, according to Rossiter and Percy (1987), “signifies the presence of a brand in a consumer’s memory and therefore indicates how well a consumer will recall or recognize that brand” (as cited by Bruhn, Schoenmueller, & Schäfer). In the online world, acknowledgment of a brand by liking or following its account, can be taken as a sign of Brand Awareness by that consumer or profile-owner. Aaker (1991) agrees with awareness being one of the pillars of equity (as cited by Romaniuk, Sharp, Paech, & Driesener). Brand equity, in itself a concept whose definition is much argued, can be described as the overall measure of the strength of consumers’ attachment to a brand (Wood, 2000). Increasing
Brand Knowledge, and therefore, Brand Equity, is then a highly desirable activity or goal for any company.

Several studies have shown that social media use does indeed affect Brand Knowledge and other marketing outcomes. Bannon (2012) cites specific ways that social media is impacting marketing in the 2012 Nielsen Social Media report. First are social word-of-mouth and the incidence of hyper-informed consumers. Consumers can now interact with or influence a much larger body of consumers through the internet. Consequently, so much more information about brands and companies are made available to the public than before through both firm and user-generated communication. Second, engagement for marketers has the potential to become more meaningful because more than a quarter of online consumers are open to receiving ads that are tailored to them through profiling, and around the same number are more likely to pay attention to an ad shared by a connection. The Nielsen Southeast Asian Digital Consumer report cites higher numbers for the Philippines, with the 2011 study positing that 43% agree that if ads can be made more relevant to them through knowledge of their internet usage patterns, they’d be glad to let advertisers know their habits.

A study by Bruhn, Schoenmueller, and Schaefer (2012) tried to find which aspects of brand knowledge and therefore, equity and purchase intention are developed by social media (both firm-generated and user-generated) versus traditional media. They found that:

The investigation of the effect sizes of traditional media and social media communications on the different dimensions of brand equity demonstrates that traditional media exert a stronger impact on brand awareness compared to social media communications, whereas social media communications have a stronger positive influence on brand image. (Discussion section, para. 2)
They also found through a study that according to the source of social media communication, the aspect of brand knowledge that is affected also differs. Firm-generated communication or communication initiated by the company or owner of the social media profile was found to increase functional brand image among recipients of the communication. Functional brand image refers to the benefits a consumer identifies with a brand that are often linked to physiological needs (also including needs for safety, problem removal, or avoidance). User-generated social communication or communication initiated by the consumer, on the other hand, was determined to affect the hedonic aspects of brand image. Keller (1993) describes the hedonic aspects of brand image to either be experiential or symbolic. Experiential benefits refer to what it feels like to use a product (sensory pleasure, variety, and cognitive stimulation) while symbolic benefits relate to underlying needs for social approval, self-esteem, or personal expression.

Overall, Bruhn, Schoenmueller, & Schaefer (2012) agree that the trend of consumers actively engaging with brands and other consumers online, as well as being hyper-informed through their use is a sufficient cause for the addition of social media strategies to the traditional marketing mix. Companies using social media can make a full approach to impacting brand success.

Company-managed or in-house social media governance in the Philippines is the focus of this study, with a view to providing a comprehensive vista of the practice among several brands under one company that is active on the local social web. The nature and effectiveness of this governance through measurement of governance efforts and the gathering of personal insights from leaders of the organization with respect to social media were also looked at.

Kent (as cited in Zerfass, Fink, & Linke, 2011, p.6) argues that the lack of social media governance in companies exposes them to significant risks. A 2011 study indicates that nine out of ten organizations, though all may have social media strategies and have existing social media communications, do not have explicit regulatory frameworks to support social media goals. Corso et al. notes:
As soon as one looks behind the scenes of the social media boom, it becomes clear that only a minority of organizations have the skills, strategies or structures which are necessary for long-term social media success. Most organizations manage their social media implementation from a predominantly technical perspective, without addressing the more strategic and structural aspects of organizational and change management (as cited in Zerfass, Fink, & Linke, 2011, p.7).

Philippine social media governance is also limited though growing. Local social media managers for large companies (50 employees and above) are often outsourced from Public Relations companies or other digital firms (which is currently booming as a service), whose social media managers almost always have no history with the company they represent and limited knowledge thereof. Social Media Management as an in-house practice becomes reserved for small businesses and start-ups looking to generate leads and find potential customers.

It becomes a significant point to begin extensive research on social media governance in the companies that will benefit from having top of mind awareness against aggressive competitors, and those with reputations to continually establish due to a more extensive set of relations such as those with investors, other media companies, and wider audience segments.

ABS-CBN Publishing Inc. or API is one such company. It’s the publishing arm of ABS-CBN Corporation, one of the top media companies in the country. The corporation spans a total of nine lines of businesses (e.g. Broadcast, Narrowcast, News, Star Cinema) in which spanning social media governance is desired to relate with the fast-growing number of Filipino internet users. To study several of API’s social media accounts’ governance frameworks becomes groundbreaking work in that it will present a closer look at one of the most volatile
industries in the digital age. The increase in consumption of content on digital screens because of the shift from print is pushing the publishing industry to make crucial analyses and key decisions about business strategy and direction. In the Philippines, this business concern is something that publishing organizations are preparing for by offering digital versions of books and magazines. This study will take a closer look at social media as a digital tool that can benefit and aid this shift, and thereby relate the need for long-term sustaining social media structure in a large organization such as ABS-CBN.

The study aimed to answer the research questions that follow. For the quantitative portion of the study, first, how do the ten active magazines of ABS-CBN Publishing Inc. score in the four indices or dimensions under Social Media Governance, namely: (a) Regulatory Framework and (b) Skills under Social Media Structure, and (c) Strategy and (d) Activities under Social Media Action? Second, how do the individual magazine accounts compare with each other with regard to Online Audience? Third, how do these magazines fare in other pertinent variables of Social Media use (Experience with Social Media, Perception of Organizational Preparedness, Collaboration, Investment, Metrics, Perception of Obstacles, and Sentiment about Social Media Work)? Fourth, what correlations between the Social Media Governance indices, its other pertinent variables, and Online Audience are significant? For the qualitative portion of the study, the goal was to describe how social media governance is viewed and managed by key personnel heading the social media efforts of the company, as well as to determine the nature of the Facebook Activity of API for its top two accounts versus main competitors as an exploration of the Social Media Strategy, and Social Media Activities Index.

Participants

For Phase One, the goal was to quantitatively describe the social media structures and actions of ABS-CBN Publishing’s ten active titles using a non-experimental survey design. Crucial to this portion were the hypotheses presented by researchers Fink, Zerfass, and Linke (2012) about social media structures and actions in a longitudinal study conducted in Germany using the Social Media Governance survey.
There are two main categories with two major variables each that have to be considered under the concept of Social Media Governance. First is social media structure, which has the indices (a) regulatory framework and (b) skills, and second, social media action, which has the indices (c) strategies and (d) activities. These were measured by the instrument and also correlated to a dependent variable introduced by the researcher in this portion of the study called Online Audience, measured by the total number of social media followers of the online accounts of the magazines studied. These variables were measured and compared across the magazines respectively, and then between them to see if an association exists between their social media governance scores and the brand awareness of the specific products among ABS-CBN’s online target market.

The respondents for Phase One included all current employees from ABS-CBN Publishing within the editorial and marketing teams of the specific magazines involved (Barbie, Chalk, Food, Metro, Metro Home & Entertaining, Metro Society, StarStudio, UAAP, Vault, and Working Mom). This at present according to letter-recipients numbers 20 non-unique employees across the ten magazines, ranging from Editors-in-Chief to Editorial Assistants within the editorial teams to certain marketing employees outside the editorial teams. One employee represented two magazines, while one marketing officer answered for two magazines making the actual count of respondents 18, three of which were male.

For Phase Two, the objective is to provide a more in-depth description of social media and the value associated with it in the context of ABS-CBN Publishing, Incorporated. For this phase, the systematic design of grounded theory (Strauss and Corbin, 1997) aided in arranging and analyzing the data from five formal semi-structured interviews, several informal unstructured interviews, participant observation, and a content analysis of API’s top two Facebook accounts (versus a main competitor’s similarly-themed accounts). The content analysis was performed as an exploratory attempt at coding two of the Social Media Governance Indices from the first phase of the study: Strategy and Activities. These were chosen for more extensive study.
rather than Regulatory Framework and Skills. This is because for Regulatory Framework, API was at the time undergoing a shift in the direction of all digital efforts and management headed by the Digital Media Division of ABS-CBN Corporation (which exists outside API). The Regulatory Framework index was also found to be weak in the first phase of the study. Skills, on the other hand, were highlighted as weaker candidate for analysis because of the aspect of self-appraisal and the weak scores of correlation it received in the first phase of the study. Besides these, Strategy and Activities were the most convenient candidates because the main units of analysis for observing these two indices are readily available: the social media accounts of the magazines themselves. They were also the most beneficial in that results from the first phase reveal that API highly values their online traffic and audience. Interviews were also semi-structured because of the nature of the second portion’s purpose and because there was a lack of organization-organized and ready data about the social media indices from API’s end. From the interviews and observations, the data produced is qualitative in nature. For the content analysis, the data are both quantitative and qualitative.

Respondents for this phase were chosen upon asking the marketing department and heads of API, including the managing director and president. Five key personnel were identified, two from within API, and three from the Digital Media Division of ABS-CBN Corp., which at the time of the study were currently managing the preparations for a shift in the digital efforts of the company.

For the content analysis, Facebook was chosen for having the highest follower and engagement rates among the social media platforms. The top two Facebook accounts of API (Chalk and Working Mom) were also compared to their nearest theme counterparts from Summit Media, which claims to be the leading publishing company in the country. The Summit accounts to be compared (Candy and Smart Parenting) also have very high online followings, so a comparison is expected to produce beneficial and significant findings.

Materials and Procedure
One survey questionnaire was for Phase One of the study -- the Social Media Governance Survey. It is an adaptation of the Social Media Governance Study Survey of 2011 (Fink, Zerfass, and Linke). It was made up of four parts, namely, (a) online experience of the organization and demographics; (b) use of social media, strategies, and tools; (c) responsibilities in the public relations department; and (d) expertise levels, use, and assessment of social media. These parts were spread out through 19 questions. Ten main questions determined the scores for the four Social Media Governance indices (Regulatory Framework, Skills, Strategy, and Activities). The rest of the questions measured the following social media use variables: Magazine’s Experience with Social Media (an ordinal variable ranging from Social Media Use Unplanned to 1-3 years of Experience with Social Media), Perceptions of Organizational Preparedness for Social Media, Social Media Collaboration among departments (which in this case are the magazines), Investments in Social Media Management, Metrics, Perception of Obstacles in Social Media Governance, and Work Sentiment. One variable not measured by the survey but obtained by the researcher for correlation studies was included as a dependent variable -- Online Audience -- which was a tally of followers of the magazines on Facebook, Twitter, and Instagram.

For the first of the four indices, regulatory framework is calculated as the sum of all structures governing social media within a company. The values for this index, labeled $I_{SMO}$, range from 0-12 (Weak regulatory framework: $0 \leq I_{SMO} \leq 4$; average: $5 \leq I_{SMO} \leq 8$; sophisticated: $9 \leq I_{SMO} \leq 12$). The second index, Skills, is represented by the index $I_{SMK}$ (Low skill level: $0 \leq I_{SMK} < 2.5$; medium skill level: $2.5 \leq I_{SMK} \leq 3.5$; high skill level: $3.5 < I_{SMK} \leq 5$). The third dimension, $I_{SMS}$, simply measures the presence of strategies through a tally. For the last index, activities, the total number of tools, networks, and applications of the company obtains the value, called $I_{SMA}$ (Low activity: $0 \leq I_{SMA} \leq 7$ (mean value); medium activity: $7 \leq I_{SMA} \leq 14$; high activity: $14 < I_{SMA} \leq 27$). All except one index was expected to be constant within each magazine: Skills. In this light, two versions of the questionnaire were made: one complete copy that measured all four indices plus the other social media variables, to be answered by a digital head or leader of each magazine, and a shortened
version of the survey that didn’t include the other assumed constant indices for anyone else in the team that managed the magazine’s social media efforts.

The rest of the questions referred to other social media use variables, and were measured by frequency and distribution tools except for Length of Experience with Social Media, Perception of Organizational Preparedness for Social Media, and Online Audience on Facebook, Twitter, and Instagram- which were all correlated to the indices.

This instrument was adapted, with permission, from the three versions of the Social Media Governance Survey made by University of Leipzig professors Stephan Fink, Ansgar Zerfass, and Anne Linke in partnership with the Public Relations firm Fink and Fuschs, and the magazine Pressesprecher. They conducted a longitudinal study across the years 2010, 2011, and 2012 in Germany spanning populations of 1007, 596, and 860 communications professionals respectively. The initial 2010 academic paper, the complete 2012 study with significant questions, results, analyses, and recommendations were released in their respective years. The 2012 release of results and analyses in English was limited to several questions and the overall results only. All questions from the publicly-released surveys were adapted by this study. First, the set of questions were reconstructed from the published results of the 2011 study. Three questions were altered due to noted changes to these specific questions in the limited release of the 2012 study. The options (for social media tools, networks and applications) were also changed to fit the nature of the social media landscape in the Philippines. These questions were improved upon each study and were based on scientific hypotheses that incorporated existing theories and past empirical research. Spearman’s Rho was used for correlation tests between indices, between the indices and online audience, between indices and other pertinent variables, and between Online Audience and other pertinent variables. Spearman’s Rho, and not Pearson’s Product-Moment Correlation Coefficient, was used because histogram analyses of the main variables did not allow the researcher to approximate normal distribution. IBM’s Statistical Package for the Social Sciences or SPSS was used for analysis.
For Phase Two, the semi-structured interviews occurred during the researcher’s 200-hour internship stay as part of API Marketing along with participant observation. Content analysis was done subsequently, after researching the tallies of online audiences of both Summit Media and another competitor, One Mega Publishing. Analyses included a month’s worth of online activity, specifically that in February 2014. This included tallying of all posts within the month, categorizing the type of posts with regards to nature of the sentence, the motive of the post, and other characteristics such as time and kind of post (text, personal or sourced photo, link, image, poll, etc.)

Results

The mean and standard deviation of the overall scores of API (See Table 1) in the four indices show a weak regulatory framework ($M = 2.4, SD = 2.06$), a medium level of expertise or skill ($M = 2.99, SD = .45$), the presence of social media strategy ($M = .9, SD = 1.37$) though in the minority, and a medium level of activity ($M = 6.8, SD = 3.43$).

Table 1: Descriptive Statistics and Correlations of Four Indices of Social Media Governance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Dev</th>
<th>$I_{SMO}$</th>
<th>$I_{SMK}$</th>
<th>$I_{SMS}$</th>
<th>$I_{SMA}$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$I_{SMO}$</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>2.06</td>
<td>$\rho=$1.00</td>
<td>$\rho=$.469</td>
<td>$\rho=$.669</td>
<td>$\rho=$.336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$I_{SMK}$</td>
<td>2.99</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>$\rho=$.469</td>
<td>$\rho=$1.00</td>
<td>$\rho=$.158</td>
<td>$\rho=$.427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$I_{SMS}$</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>$\rho=$.669</td>
<td>$\rho=$.158</td>
<td>$\rho=$1.00</td>
<td>$\rho=$.503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$I_{SMA}$</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>3.43</td>
<td>$\rho=$.336</td>
<td>$\rho=$.427</td>
<td>$\rho=$.503</td>
<td>$\rho=$1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Bold values are significant at $p<.05$.

Of the ten magazines included in this study, Chalk, Working Mom, and Metro have the highest Facebook followers (in decreasing order) while newcomer accounts Barbie and Vault have the lowest. For
Twitter; Metro, Chalk, and Star Studio are the most popular accounts out of five active accounts. For Instagram: only Metro, Chalk, and Working Mom are present on the platform. In total, the highest-ranking accounts when measuring Online Audience are, from the highest; Chalk, Working Mom, and Metro magazine (See Table 2). Most magazines have been using social media for a period ranging from one to three years at API ($M = 4.4$, $SD = .52$). For Perception of Organizational Preparedness, a mean that falls under the category of Averagely-Equipped is observed ($M = 2.92$, $SD = .71$) with UAAP, Vault and Chalk citing that they find that their particular groups are poorly-equipped for social media use.

Table 2: Social Media Online Audience

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Magazine</th>
<th>Facebook</th>
<th>Twitter</th>
<th>Instagram</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Barbie</td>
<td>824</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>824</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chalk</td>
<td>54,102</td>
<td>11,682</td>
<td>6,010</td>
<td>71,794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food</td>
<td>6,458</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>6,458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metro</td>
<td>26,573</td>
<td>12,108</td>
<td>9,127</td>
<td>47,808</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metro H&amp;E</td>
<td>1,812</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1,812</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metro Society</td>
<td>1,324</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1,324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Star Studio</td>
<td>19,405</td>
<td>8,907</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>28,312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UAAP</td>
<td>2,029</td>
<td>2,153</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4,182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vault</td>
<td>959</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>959</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working Mom</td>
<td>49,319</td>
<td>517</td>
<td>258</td>
<td>50,094</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Correlation studies revealed four significant relationships. Online Audience had very high correlations with the Regulatory Framework index ($\rho=.83$, $p = .00$), the Strategy index ($\rho=.84$, $p = .00$), and Experience with social media, given by length of use of social media use ($\rho=.78$, $p = .00$). An almost perfect correlation also exists between the Regulatory Framework index and Experience with social media ($\rho=.97$, $p = .01$). (See Table 3). With Online Audience as the dependent variable and the four indices along with the two other social media variables as the independent variables, regression analysis was also conducted. Results
show that only the Regulatory Framework is a significant predictor of Online Audience \( (r^2 = .73, p = .007) \).

Table 3: Social Media Governance Indices Correlations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Experience with Social Media</th>
<th>Perception of Organizational Preparedness</th>
<th>Online Audience</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ISMO</td>
<td>( \rho = .968^* )</td>
<td>( \rho = .379 )</td>
<td>( \rho = .826^* )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISMK</td>
<td>( \rho = -.428 )</td>
<td>( \rho = -.539 )</td>
<td>( \rho = -.170 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISMS</td>
<td>( \rho = .563 )</td>
<td>( \rho = .154 )</td>
<td>( \rho = .843^* )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISMA</td>
<td>( \rho = .253 )</td>
<td>( \rho = -.270 )</td>
<td>( \rho = .426 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>( \rho = 1.00 )</td>
<td>( \rho = .398 )</td>
<td>( \rho = .782^* )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparedness</td>
<td>( \rho = .398 )</td>
<td>( \rho = 1.00 )</td>
<td>( \rho = .130 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online Audience</td>
<td>( \rho = .782^* )</td>
<td>( \rho = .130 )</td>
<td>( \rho = 1.00 )</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Other variables measured by the instrument present the following findings. Collaboration with regard to social media in API was noted to be very spontaneous and experimental, independently done by each magazine but with little guidance. Investment of time and effort primarily fell on managing and creating content for the social media accounts. For metrics, number of followers and traffic are at present the most significant to the API magazines. When respondents were asked, they also said that they find a lack of conclusive concepts to be the greatest obstacle in social media governance, followed by it requiring extra effort on top of current workloads. The need to be “always on”, as well as the increasing pressure are the most agreed upon sentiments about social media governance.

Phase Two revealed that due to the abrupt rise of social media use in the country, no extensive research was made before key social media accounts were made. The team organizing the launch of the
accounts then simply assessed the likelihood that specific magazines’ target audiences would be active on specific social networks. If a specific target of a magazine was economically able to access the internet frequently and was inclined to attending social events, for example, a Twitter account would then have been considered. There is also no rigid structure for each magazine though administration responsibilities are shared among editorial and marketing officers.

The recent formation of the Digital Media Division or DMD of ABS-CBN is a major consideration for social media structure. API coordinates with Karen Tumbali as she is the account manager for Print and Cable Channel Media. She keeps watch over all the social accounts as well as handles the team in charge of digitizing the issues of API. Ideally this should be handled within API but their current workload cannot accommodate the extra task. Dr Donald Lim, who was put in charge of DMD several months ago coming from heading the digital services of McCann Worldgroup Manila, shared that the future of social media structure in all of ABS-CBN will not be the limiting of independence now given to the company’s hundreds of social media account managers, but rather education. With regard to structure, most subsidiaries and services are then expected to stay the same as Dr Lim acknowledges they are in the best position to determine their own regulatory frameworks. Rather than making a structure, regulatory framework will focus on accountability and centralizing the best practices. Ramon “Mon” Lizardo, head of Digital Audience Management, noted that these best practices will stem from DMD, and the accounts they directly handle like the ABS-CBN channel Facebook page, Twitter, and YouTube accounts. These accounts (such as News and Broadcasting) however, do not share the same content as API’s accounts and the products and goals they have, though both forms of media, are not similar in that a one-fits-all regulatory framework may suffice. Social Media architecture, as Dr Lim puts it, will be set in place to guide all accounts of the company. This will include: Approval of accounts (which shows, artists, and products can have accounts), Delegation of responsibilities (who can and cannot post for an account), Content Rules (what can and cannot be posted on personal accounts that involve the workplace, what can and cannot be posted on company accounts), and
streamlining of social media activities, e.g., rules about hashtags, among many others.

Strategy, where it exists, is mostly fluid and a matter of task delegation and unwritten guideline-provision in API. “Strategy” was observed to signify, among interviewees and employees, a flow or process with certain type of content rather than an approach for certain long-term targets. Great importance is currently being put on Social Media Listening and Digital Audience Management in ABS-CBN. It is, at present, an expanding department within DMD that uses Radian6, a social listening tool that can monitor not only the accounts handled by ABS-CBN but monitors all sentiments about ABS-CBN brands across the web. This is a strategic use of social media that can go beyond just pushing messages to online audiences but also making strategic reactions and preemptive moves to counter or prepare for negative sentiment, respectively. As for social media activities, they are currently concentrated on three platforms: Facebook, Twitter, and Instagram.

The analysis of Facebook page activity for a total of four accounts was performed (See Table 4). API’s top two Facebook pages based on Online Audience (Chalk and Working Mom) were compared with their theme counterparts in Summit Media Publishing (Candy and Smart Parenting). The variables noted to be of importance were the total number of fans, posts, likes, shares, and comments for the specified duration. It has to be noted that since the researcher does not have administrative access to these accounts and their corresponding evaluation mechanisms, these quantitative variables can only provide estimates of the total interactions that an account’s online audience has made with the brand.

For the four accounts, it is observable that Summit accounts score higher in all the engagement dimensions, though not considerably higher in the number of posts compared to API accounts. This is most likely due to the number of fans the account has that are able to view the posts of the brand. However, it is also evident that the “Talking
about this”¹ metric percentages show that API accounts barely reach the standard for a good standing, while Summit magazines fare very well in the specific metric considering the number of fans they have. With regard to the date the sites were launched, which is a more specific variable similar to the Length of Experience variable in the first phase of the study, it is noticeable that Working Mom and Smart Parenting were launched within months of each other but currently differ considerably with their engagement levels. An important difference between the magazines not apparent in the table is that both Summit magazines, similar to the rest of their roster, have an accompanying website where Facebook actions may be embedded so that a post that appears simultaneously in the website and on the account page counts the total number of interactions, and not separately. For the Summit accounts studied, the particular action embedded in their magazine websites is the “Share” button.

¹“Talking about this” is engagement metric that counts how many times fans have interacted with a brand over the past seven days through any of the following: liking a page, posting to a page’s wall, liking, commenting on or sharing a page’s post or content, answering a question posted, responding to an event invite, mentioning a page in a post, tagging a page photo, etc. (Finn, 2011). According to Finn (2011), this metric is in good standing if it is 5% of a page’s “likes” count that is over 100,000, and 10% if the “likes” are less than 100,000.
Table 4: Descriptive Statistics for Facebook Page Activity (February 2014)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Magazine</th>
<th>Launch Date</th>
<th>Fans</th>
<th>Rank*</th>
<th>TAT**</th>
<th>Posts</th>
<th>Engagement Metrics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>% of Fans</td>
<td>Likes</td>
<td>Shares</td>
<td>Comments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>API</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chalk Working</td>
<td>01/07/10</td>
<td>54,102</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3,732</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>2,063  157  36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mom</td>
<td>01/30/10</td>
<td>49,319</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>585</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>603    22   13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candy Smart</td>
<td>11/19/07</td>
<td>1,399,792</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>78,300</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parenting</td>
<td>10/20/09</td>
<td>401,601</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>53,226</td>
<td>13.2%</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: * Rank in their respective publishing companies according to number of FB fans.
**The TAT or “Talking about This” metric was measured on March 5 2014. This metric measures the interaction activity on a page within the last seven days.

To distinguish the activity between the two and determine if a pattern may exist among API accounts compared to Summit accounts that may give insight about the differences in engagement, a diagram of the activity of the two publishers was made. The analysis of the tabulations and other variables of activity provided the contents of the diagram and formed a dimension map (see Figure 1). This map is centered on the main phenomenon that causes engagement -- a Facebook post. The Reasons for Posting were determined by classifying the nature of the post: the beneficiaries of the post, the actual content, and the call-to-action the post has. The Characteristics of the Post describe the manner it was posted, the source of content, and the time of the post though it could not be determined by the researcher without administrative access. The Type of Post describes the strategy or the main purpose of the actual post in connection with the audience of fans. The Reactions are the interactions the fans initiate as consequences of the post. This is moderated by Promotions and Filters, which are intervening variables such as blocking mechanisms made by the administrator for particular posts, or promotions of certain posts through either Facebook
mechanisms or external mechanisms such as attaching the post to a website where fans or website viewers may still interact with it. The latter mechanism currently only allows “sharing” of content from the website for the Summit accounts studied.

Figure 1. Dimension Map of a Facebook Post

For API’s Chalk (See Figure 2), most of the posts served the purpose of Marketing or Issue Promotion. Marketing needs varied between promoting other print or non-print media brands of ABS-CBN and event partners. For Issue Promotion, both digital and print issues were promoted but with great emphasis on the latter. For Working Mom, Insider Sharing was the most common reason for posting, ahead of Issue Promotion. For Issue Promotion, five to eight posts were present per magazine during the month of February 2014. For Insider Sharing, the kinds of posts varied greatly. Working Mom had a majority of personal events, making the Facebook account seem similar to a personal account. Editorial events signify photo shoots, meetings or behind-the-scenes posts, and though these are generally for an issue, the approach was more personal and seemed more fit to serve identity-building than the promotion of an issue since the issues were rarely mentioned,
especially for Working Mom. General content consists of news links and holiday greetings. Lastly, content requests are basically questions that serve to get input, build networks, or stir up engagement. Both API accounts had negligible amounts of this type. For the social media accounts of Summit (See Figure 3), almost all posts serve to draw the audience to a feature on the magazine website, varying greatly from API. Almost all of Summit’s magazines have a website besides their social media accounts.

Figure 2. Dimension Map of a Facebook Post – Chalk and Working Mom Magazine
The two main types of posts identified were information-giving and information-requesting posts, though for both API accounts, the former was much more common. Calls-to-action (by clicking a link, mostly) for information-giving posts were present for posts but not in the majority. For Summit, the former was also more common but calls-to-action punctuated almost every post since they were attractive links to the magazine website (tutorials, and gallery-type articles where a few photos or short videos known as “gifs” with captions).

Discussion

For Phase One of the study, Online Audience was a variable introduced by the researcher, computed by totaling the number of online followers on the Facebook, Twitter, and Instagram accounts of each
magazine. These accounts were chosen because they were the main online social accounts of the magazine and were the focus of current efforts. Though the followers may be non-unique among these platforms, the tally of online following is significant because it determines the audience of the brand’s messages and the potential for growth of that number. On Facebook in particular, growth potential exists because of the number of friends that a follower has, termed “organic reach” in social media. These followers can “like” a brand’s post, photo, or comment on a post, and “share” the post and even the Facebook page itself to be seen and potentially followed by that account holder’s friends. Bruhn, Schoenmueller, and Schaefer (2012) also found that Online Audience is important as the recipient of a brand’s effort at communicating Brand Image.

The lack of more concrete strategies for API accounts versus other ABS-CBN accounts like Myx Philippines and ABS-CBN News, which were top-notchers in the 2013 assessment of Facebook media pages (SocialBakers, 2013), may be with regard to both the nature of their products and the focus given by top management.

For product nature, for example, News’ and Myx’s target as broadcasted products is to gain more viewers, which can easily flock to their products on their respective websites. Social media for TV or “Social TV” is both a concept and practice that is also piquing researchers’ interests and may explain great focus of media companies on their social efforts for their TV sites rather than other media like radio and print. A neuro-marketing study by Australian companies MEC and the 7 network found that social media engagement raises TV engagement significantly so that ads also receive heightened awareness and engagement (MEC, 2013). Print, however, does not share that nature of broadcasted media of simultaneous delivery to audiences, making social media activity related to print a pre- or post-delivery type of activity, and one that has not been studied extensively compared to the former.

For focus given by top management, ABS-CBN’s main competitors as a media agency are not their main competitors as
publishers, so the budget of the entire company is split differently as well with regard to which business is prioritized. ABS-CBN mobile, launched by the company recently for example, is expected to receive a huge chunk of monetary and structural investment. Budgets for other subsidiaries such as API are somehow expected to lessen.

The content analysis made evident that a major difference between the API and Summit dimension maps exists with regard to mostly the reasons for posting, the source of posts, and the promotion of posts. Summit’s embedded posts on their website, along with the dedication to the growth of content on their website signify that they are more focused on content that draws their audiences from the social media platforms to their websites. This “drive-to-site” strategy is common among cable channel social media accounts of ABS-CBN, but not among the print media accounts, which have no accompanying website except for Metro Magazine (currently inactive). It is interesting to note that the content shared on the Summit accounts from their sites is not necessarily content printed on the issues themselves. This could mean that the attention Summit is giving to their sites may have to do with their ad placements, and that tactics to encourage sales of the issues (both print and digital) are focused on the site, with social media serving as a valued space efficiently capable of growing their online network or audience. Even with the quantity of interactions they receive, there was no effort for advertisement or partner placements in the two social media accounts studied, unlike the API accounts which have that as one of their main concerns. For Publishing as an industry, the shift of content to the web is a means for survival, according to ABS-CBN Digital Audience Management head Ramon Lizardo. API’s strategy at providing online content consists of features on media partner sites and providing the digital versions of their magazines on Zinio or Apple Newsstand. API would do well to consider how they can get content to grow their Online Audience since their advertisements will rely on such a metric more heavily in the digital age. With strategies and content so different, API will greatly benefit when they evaluate, as planned, the worth of their accounts in their entirety, and the sustainability of their digital efforts.
Another significant point arises from Summit’s focus on content and their websites. The question of Summit Media slowly but strategically shifting its magazine content or even non-magazine content to online platforms (through digital subscriptions, the websites, and social media) should be of major concern to API. It is apt to consider that Summit Media is doing so because the company is preparing for what it believes is the future of the publishing industry, at least in the Philippines. Publishing has knowledge and opinion in the form of informative and entertainment stories as its core offerings and the dynamic of receiving such communication in the traditional sense that is print may be moving in the direction of the asynchronous two-way means of communication that characterizes conversation because of Web 2.0 technologies that exist and are trumping traditional print communication today (Ramon Lizardo, personal communication, February 13, 2014). With API’s current roster of marketing officers, editorial teams, and business unit managers, a change in the regulatory framework placing greater emphasis on content and growth of online audience can be managed. Interviews with digital account officers from a major advertising firm and a public relations firm, respectively, affirm that such a move can be made. A regular online community manager for a digital firm can handle up to more than ten accounts at a time though five would be ideal (R. Surtida, personal communication, February 21, 2014). The amount of effort to grow one account, therefore, can be assumed to be easily collectively managed by those already present within API for each specific magazine. What’s necessary is a shift in strategy and direction, should the company be willing to undertake it. It is possible that the value placed upon social media in API may not be as heavy as in other accounts like previously determined by the interviews done in phase 2 of this study. API respondents, however, were found to be of the opinion that the move to become more aggressive on such frontiers is inevitably necessary.

Limitation and Research Directions

This study aimed to describe the social media framework, skills, strategies and activities of both ABS-CBN Publishing Inc. along with other pertinent variables of Social Media Governance, including Brand Awareness as measured by the online audience (number of followers) of
the magazines. The relationships and conclusions established in this study cannot be generalized to be true of other corporations and target markets. The indices and values presented are highly expected to change over time in both meaning and scoring due to the evolving nature of social media communication.

From the results of this study, it can be deduced that success in online brand awareness is related to governance efforts, most especially the existence of a social media strategy of the people involved and the establishment of a sophisticated regulatory framework. For future research, it is recommended that first, the company be re-evaluated after changes have been applied with regard to the social media strategy and framework within API. Other lines of businesses in the entire ABS-CBN corporation (film, TV, mobile) would also benefit from an analysis of social media efforts. Second, a revision of the social media governance survey is suggested to fit the context of Philippine social media practices. The findings of an exploratory study of local digital firm practices may be combined with the themes of the survey used in this study and others used by similar studies in Australia and the United States by Professors Jim MacNamara of the University of Technology in Sydney and Professor Donald Wright from Boston University, respectively (Public Relations Institute of Australia, n.d.) to help create the new instrument. Finally, further studies that are recommended follow: a more in-depth study of the competing publishing industries’ Social Media Governance efforts, also with relation to online Brand Awareness (Summit Media, One Mega Publishing), content analysis of uploads across different social media platforms or across competing companies’ accounts on one platform, comparative studies on brands’ social media personas and their relation to company goals and brand identity, and studies determining dimension maps for all other social media platforms, as well as competing accounts across a platform.

References


Zerfass, A., Fink, S., & Linke, A. (2011). *Social Media Governance: Regulatory Frameworks as drivers of success in online*
communications.

Retrieved from:
https://www.academia.edu/1049739/Social_Media_Governance_Regulatory_frameworks_as_drivers_of_success_in_online_communications